1	BEFORE THE ILLINOIS COMMERCE COMMISSION
2	ILLINOIS COMMERCE COMMISSION
3	IN THE MATTER OF:
4	STUART SMETTERS,)
5	Complainant,)
6	vs.) No. 12-0223
7	COMMONWEALTH EDISON COMPANY) and INTEGRYS ENERGY SERVICES,)
8	INC., Respondents.)
9	Respondents.
10	Chicago, Illinois April 25, 2012
11	
12	Met, pursuant to notice, at 11:00 a.m.
13	BEFORE:
14	JOHN T. RILEY, Administrative Law Judge
	APPEARANCES:
15	MARK L. GOLDSTEIN, PC, by
16	MR. MARK L. GOLDSTEIN 3019 Province Circle
17	Mundelein, Illinois 60060 (847) 949-1340
18	for Commonwealth Edison Company and Integrys
19	Energy Services, Inc.;
20	EXELON BUSINESS SERVICES COMPANY, by MR. BRADLEY R. PERKINS
21	10 South Dearborn Street 49th Floor
22	Chicago, Illinois 60603 (312) 294-2632 for Commonwealth Edison Company.

1		,
2	SULLIVAN REPORTING COMPANY, Auhdikiam Carney, CSR License No. 084-004658	ру
3	Electise No. 001 001050	
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		

1			<u>I</u> <u>N</u> <u>I</u>	<u>E</u> <u>X</u>		
2	Witnesses:	Direct	Cross	Re- direct		
3	None.	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u>urrece</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
4						
5						
6						
7						
8						
9				<u>B</u> <u>I</u> <u>T</u> <u>S</u>		
10	Number None.	For	Identi	ificatio	on_	<u>In Evidence</u>
11						
12						
13						
14						
15						
16						
17 18						
19						
20						
21						
22						

- 1 JUDGE RILEY: Pursuant to the direction of the
- 2 Illinois Commerce Commission, I call Docket
- 3 No. 12-0223. This is a complaint by Stuart Smetters
- 4 versus Commonwealth Edison Company and Integrys
- 5 Energy Services, Inc., as to billing/charges in
- 6 Mundelein, Illinois.
- 7 Mr. Smetters, you are here appearing
- 8 without counsel at this time; is that correct?
- 9 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Correct.
- 10 JUDGE RILEY: Just to advise you, you can have
- 11 counsel appear on your behalf anytime you so choose,
- 12 however, they would have to take the record as it's
- 13 been developed. We never go back all the way to the
- 14 start.
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: Correct. Unfortunately I
- 16 cannot afford counsel.
- 17 JUDGE RILEY: That's understood.
- 18 Mr. Goldstein, would you enter an
- 19 appearance for ComEd.
- 20 MR. GOLDSTEIN: On behalf of Commonwealth
- 21 Edison Company and Integrys Energy Services, Inc.,
- 22 Mark L. Goldstein, 3019 Province Circle, Mundelein,

- 1 Illinois 60060. My telephone number is (847)
- 2 949-1340.
- 3 MR. PERKINS: On behalf of Commonwealth Edison
- 4 Company, Brad Perkins, 10 South Dearborn Street,
- 5 Suite 4900, Chicago, Illinois 60603. My telephone
- 6 number is (312) 394-2632.
- 7 JUDGE RILEY: Thank you.
- 8 MR. GOLDSTEIN: I would also like to enter the
- 9 appearance of Erin Buechler on behalf of Commonwealth
- 10 Edison.
- 11 JUDGE RILEY: Okay.
- Mr. Smetters, going through your
- 13 complaint, it seems to me that you at one time had
- 14 service through Integrys, and was Commonwealth Edison
- 15 the billing agent for them?
- 16 MR. STUART SMETTERS: No. Actually what had
- 17 happened was is I had them with North Shore Gas
- 18 Company and I had Integrys as my gas supplier.
- 19 JUDGE RILEY: All right.
- 20 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Now, we went through a
- 21 very hard winter. Right now I go through a
- 22 tremendous amount of discrimination in the city of

- 1 Mundelein where employment is concerned, so I am
- 2 unemployed.
- JUDGE RILEY: All right.
- 4 MR. STUART SMETTERS: And I do mean a
- 5 tremendous amount.
- JUDGE RILEY: Well, okay.
- 7 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Anyway, we came out of
- 8 Winter into March. We had contacted Peoples Gas for
- 9 a short term payment plan, which is allowed by the
- 10 State of Illinois Commerce Commission. And they had
- 11 agreed to it, put us on a payment plan, and we paid
- 12 the deposit. Immediately afterwards Integrys started
- 13 screaming bloody murder about the fact that we were
- 14 paying North Shore Gas this money, and they weren't
- 15 receiving it from North Shore and actually started a
- 16 fight between us and North Shore. I was constantly
- 17 on the phone every other day between them and North
- 18 Shore. This went on almost every month.
- 19 After we paid all four payments and we
- 20 were now caught up and paid in full, now Integrys
- 21 contacted North Shore Gas and demanded that we be
- 22 shut off. North Shore Gas right now is sending me

- 1 letters to this date, in fact, the actual copy from
- 2 Integrys requiring that they shut me off.
- 3 Integrys -- I had -- because I had some decent --
- 4 what I felt was decent business with Integrys up
- 5 until February -- when Integrys contacted me about
- 6 joining with their electric company, yes, I had agree
- 7 to it. They were not supposed to start operations
- 8 until the 3rd of April.
- 9 When they started causing these
- 10 problems with me and the gas company, I realized they
- 11 would get total control of my house, so I contacted
- 12 them immediately and said forget it. I've got the
- 13 telephone numbers here that I called for them. I
- 14 also called Commonwealth Edison and told them at the
- 15 same time to cease any business with Integrys. I was
- 16 not authorizing them.
- 17 JUDGE RILEY: All right.
- 18 MR. STUART SMETTERS: I do have that right to
- 19 do so as long as they had not connected the power as
- of yet.
- JUDGE RILEY: So you had a prior dispute with
- 22 Integrys with regard to gas service?

- 1 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Correct, which was
- 2 happening at the exact same time.
- JUDGE RILEY: And you're saying that after you
- 4 had agreed to electric service with Integrys, you
- 5 thought that somehow the prior dispute had spilled
- 6 over?
- 7 MR. STUART SMETTERS: I didn't want to take a
- 8 chance because it was the same company.
- 9 JUDGE RILEY: Now, did you sign a contract with
- 10 Integrys or with Commonwealth Edison?
- 11 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Strictly over the phone.
- 12 JUDGE RILEY: With whom?
- 13 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Over the phone.
- 14 JUDGE RILEY: All right.
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: And I also -- like I
- 16 said, I called both the cancelation number -- I
- 17 called both Integrys and then I called the
- 18 cancelation number at Commonwealth Edison and
- 19 canceled Integrys before they were even hooked up.
- 20 JUDGE RILEY: Okay. And are you now being
- 21 billed by Integrys?
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: They kept right on

- 1 billing me with Commonwealth Edison anyways right on
- 2 through -- all the way into August, September and
- 3 through January. In fact, I had to have you guys
- 4 assist --
- 5 JUDGE RILEY: So essentially what you're saying
- 6 is that you called Integrys to cancel the service and
- 7 they have not canceled the service. They're still
- 8 providing your electricity --
- 9 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Not anymore; but at that
- 10 point, yes, they were.
- JUDGE RILEY: And how much do they want from
- 12 you?
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: They've actually gone --
- 14 I've actually gotten to the point where I do not know
- 15 anymore. I've asked Commonwealth Edison to please
- 16 cease with the billing. They've added interest on
- 17 top of theirs plus late charges on a regular basis.
- JUDGE RILEY: How long were you actually being
- 19 supplied electricity by Integrys?
- 20 MR. STUART SMETTERS: From April until --
- JUDGE RILEY: April of when? What year?
- 22 MR. STUART SMETTERS: 2011.

- JUDGE RILEY: Okay.
- 2 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Through -- finally into
- 3 September --
- 4 JUDGE RILEY: From April through September of
- 5 2011?
- 6 MR. STUART SMETTERS: -- September, October
- 7 thereabout.
- 8 JUDGE RILEY: And is this matter in the hands
- 9 of a collection agency now?
- 10 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Commonwealth Edison.
- 11 They have become the collection agency.
- JUDGE RILEY: Well, what's the latest
- documentation you have from Commonwealth Edison as to
- 14 the amount owed?
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: Right now I'm just
- 16 touching over \$1,000. At that time, it was close to
- 17 \$500, \$600 I was owing Integrys.
- 18 JUDGE RILEY: So Commonwealth Edison is now
- 19 supplying your electricity?
- 20 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Correct.
- JUDGE RILEY: So what they're trying to do --
- it seems to me then is that they're trying collect

- 1 the amount you owe Integrys -- what Integrys alleges
- 2 you owe them, plus ComEd's own --
- 3 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Correct. Plus interest,
- 4 plus late fees.
- JUDGE RILEY: Mr. Goldstein, what's Integrys'
- 6 response to this?
- 7 MR. GOLDSTEIN: With respect to Integrys, all
- 8 that Mr. Smetters has been charged is a \$50
- 9 termination fee based upon his agreement with
- 10 Integrys. And as of right now, there's a zero
- 11 balance on his account with respect to Integrys. I
- 12 have no clue in the world why Integrys is part of the
- 13 complaint.
- 14 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Because you did not take
- 15 Integrys off. In fact, I have statements --
- 16 MR. GOLDSTEIN: And that's where it stands.
- 17 There's a zero balance as of November 28th, 2011,
- 18 well before Mr. Smetters filed his complaint here.
- 19 MR. STUART SMETTERS: No, they did not take it
- 20 off. In fact, I made my complaints to Ken Kirchner
- 21 here at the Illinois Commerce Building. He issued
- 22 statements to them to cease beginning in October --

- 1 actually he started earlier than that.
- 2 And then in November they started
- 3 making statements that I was satisfied with their
- 4 communications and I was not satisfied. They made
- 5 statements to the ICC that were not true. Not only
- 6 did they do so, but they committed perjury as well.
- 7 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Mr. Smetters, under the terms
- 8 of his agreement with Integrys, if he were to cancel,
- 9 there was a \$100 termination fee. That fee was
- 10 reduced to \$50. Mr. Smetters paid the \$50. There is
- 11 a zero balance --
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: No, I would not pay
- 13 Integrys.
- 14 MR. GOLDSTEIN: -- and the other \$50 was
- 15 refunded back and he's done.
- 16 JUDGE RILEY: In other words, what Integrys'
- 17 record show is that they are satisfied -- that the
- 18 amount was satisfied, the amount was paid, and that
- 19 he has a zero balance with Integrys. That's what
- 20 their records show, so everything else is with
- 21 Commonwealth Edison.
- 22 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Correct.

- 1 MR. STUART SMETTERS: No, sir, there is not.
- 2 In fact, I kept receiving a bill with Integrys on the
- 3 Commonwealth Edison bills.
- 4 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Do you have your current bill?
- 5 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Current bill, yes. The
- 6 current bill it's off, but past bills --
- 7 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Well, That's exactly my point.
- 8 MR. STUART SMETTERS: And once more is, I
- 9 canceled them before they even hooked up. So they
- 10 had no authority to request anything at all,
- 11 especially considered it was result of a criminal act
- 12 underpart.
- 13 Here's the current bill. You are
- 14 correct, the previous balance of \$578.65 is from
- 15 Integrys.
- 16 JUDGE RILEY: Let me see that.
- 17 MR. STUART SMETTERS: This one doesn't exactly
- 18 say it, however, you kept on putting them on there in
- 19 the line as to who was supplying and you didn't
- 20 remove them until that bill.
- 21 MR. GOLDSTEIN: I don't believe that Integrys
- 22 ever supplied Mr. Smetters with any electricity.

- 1 That bill is a ComEd bill. If there's any money owed
- on the account it's through ComEd.
- 3 JUDGE RILEY: Let the record reflect that it is
- 4 a bill from ComEd with a particular account number,
- 5 the name, Stuart Smetters. I don't see any reference
- 6 to Integrys on here, unless I missed something on the
- 7 reverse side.
- 8 MR. GOLDSTEIN: No.
- 9 MR. STUART SMETTERS: They switched it from
- 10 Integrys to Electric Supply Services. Electric
- 11 Supply Services you'll notice turned out to be just a
- 12 month.
- 13 MR. GOLDSTEIN: I just don't see it. Can we
- 14 take a short recess, perhaps --
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: It says here, I may
- 16 rescind my agreement with Integrys or cancel pending
- 17 enrollment within 10 calendar days after ComEd
- 18 processes the enrollment. They were called before
- 19 they even hooked up.
- 20 JUDGE RILEY: Okay.
- Mr. Goldstein, you asked for a brief
- 22 recess?

- 1 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Yes. We might have to get
- 2 Ms. Buechler whose got more information on the ComEd
- 3 side of the bill. Let me go get her.
- 4 (Whereupon, a recess was taken.)
- 5 JUDGE RILEY: Mr. Goldstein, you conferred with
- 6 your colleague?
- 7 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Yes. I think Mr. Perkins can
- 8 take over.
- 9 MR. PERKINS: So Commonwealth Edison's records
- indicate that he enrolled with -- Mr. Smetters,
- 11 enrolled in RES service with Integrys on June 13th,
- 12 2011. He subsequently asked to be removed from RES
- 13 service on July 11th, 2011, which was after the five
- 14 days to withdraw from service without having it show
- 15 up on the bill. And so there was one bill -- it is
- 16 ComEd's understanding that there was one bill that
- 17 Integrys would show up as the supplier of
- 18 electricity. The remainder of the outstanding
- 19 balance, it's our understanding, is related to past
- 20 service that just wasn't paid.
- JUDGE RILEY: And is it my understanding that
- 22 Mr. Goldstein was correct earlier that the balance

- 1 with Integrys has been zeroed out, that all moneys
- 2 have been paid?
- 3 MR. GOLDSTEIN: There was a \$50 fee that was
- 4 required for termination of the service. That fee
- 5 was paid.
- 6 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Integrys was
- 7 authorized --
- 8 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Can I finish, sir.
- 9 MR. STUART SMETTERS: My apologies.
- 10 MR. GOLDSTEIN: So with that, there's a zero
- 11 balance as between Mr. Smetters and Integrys, and
- 12 whatever is owed is owed to Commonwealth Edison for
- 13 electric service.
- 14 JUDGE RILEY: And what it comes down to is just
- 15 usage, fees, taxes?
- MR. PERKINS: Yep.
- JUDGE RILEY: Mr. Smetters, having heard that,
- 18 what's your response?
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: You're way off. Integrys
- 20 was authorized in February -- at the end of
- 21 February --
- JUDGE RILEY: This year?

- 1 MR. STUART SMETTERS: No, 2011.
- 2 They advised me they would be starting
- 3 service on April 3rd, 2011. They were contacted
- 4 before they were given -- the date in June that he's
- 5 talking about is the same time as Integrys now tried
- 6 to cancel the gas company not -- in which case I had
- 7 to constantly remind Commonwealth Edison on a regular
- 8 basis from March, April, May, June and then every
- 9 single month afterwards at the beginning of the
- 10 month. In fact, I've got attempts to contact
- 11 Commonwealth Edison, in which case I had to spend
- 12 well over an hour, two hours on the phone --
- 13 JUDGE RILEY: What were you contacting
- 14 Commonwealth Edison about?
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: To leave Integrys off the
- 16 bill. They were on a regular basis.
- 17 JUDGE RILEY: And Integrys was out of the
- 18 picture as of July?
- 19 MR. STUART SMETTERS: They were not out of the
- 20 picture.
- JUDGE RILEY: Mr. Perkins what's your --
- 22 MR. STUART SMETTERS: In fact, I had to get Ken

- 1 Kirchner involved in it starting with them and their
- 2 involvement with North Shore Gas.
- 3 JUDGE RILEY: How long do you contend that
- 4 Integrys was providing you with electricity?
- 5 MR. STUART SMETTERS: All the way from the
- 6 beginning of April all the way through October.
- 7 JUDGE RILEY: Mr. Perkins, is that square with
- 8 your records?
- 9 MR. PERKINS: No. Our records indicate that he
- 10 returned the bundled service on July 11th, 2011. So
- 11 there may be a July bill that reflects Integrys
- depending on the billing cycle, maybe even August,
- presumably not, we'd have to look.
- 14 JUDGE RILEY: But he ceased service with
- 15 Integrys in July of 2011 and all electricity was --
- 16 MR. PERKINS: All bundled service would have
- 17 come from Commonwealth Edison at that time.
- 18 MR. GOLDSTEIN: I think that Mr. Smetters ought
- 19 to produce the bills from -- he says that he had
- 20 service from Integrys in March of 2011 --
- 21 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Not a problem. I still
- 22 have them right now. I can bring them in.

- 1 JUDGE RILEY: Okay. We understand that.
- 2 MR. GOLDSTEIN: The records show, as
- 3 Mr. Perkins has stated, that Mr. Smetters enrolled
- 4 with Integrys to provide electric service on June
- 5 11th.
- 6 JUDGE RILEY: All right.
- 7 MR. GOLDSTEIN: June 13th -- I'm sorry.
- 8 MR. STUART SMETTERS: On June 13th?
- 9 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Yes.
- 10 MR. STUART SMETTERS: On June 13th?
- JUDGE RILEY: Of 2011.
- MR. GOLDSTEIN: Of 2011.
- 13 MR. STUART SMETTERS: That sounds like fun. I
- 14 was in Rush Hospital from June 6th until the 21st.
- MR. GOLDSTEIN: Okay. Whatever.
- 16 MR. STUART SMETTERS: I had a Kidney being
- 17 removed as well as a rib.
- JUDGE RILEY: Ms. Goldstein is just speaking
- 19 from what the records show.
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: Well, the records are way
- 21 off because I had to be -- somehow or another I used
- 22 ESP to authorize Integrys then.

- JUDGE RILEY: Why don't we do this -- we're
- 2 kind of at an impasse here. You insist that you have
- 3 records that are contrary to what Commonwealth
- 4 Edison's record show.
- 5 MR. STUART SMETTERS: I can't produce them
- 6 right now.
- 7 JUDGE RILEY: Can you send copies of those
- 8 bills that you have showing --
- 9 MR. STUART SMETTERS: I will get them and I
- 10 will share them.
- 11 JUDGE RILEY: -- showing Integrys -- can you
- 12 get copies of those to Mr. Goldstein?
- 13 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Yes.
- 14 MR. GOLDSTEIN: And I'll provide them to
- 15 Mr. Perkins, too, if you get them to me.
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: Not a problem.
- 17 JUDGE RILEY: Okay. Why don't we leave it at
- that then for the time being. I'll give this one
- 19 more status. And I'll I've give you a chance to get
- 20 copies of those statements, Mr. Smetters.
- 21 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Can I have verification
- 22 of the statement that he made that I supposedly

- 1 started service with Integrys in June?
- 2 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Yes, sir.
- 3 MR. STUART SMETTERS: This is going to be fun.
- 4 MR. GOLDSTEIN: That's what ComEd's records
- 5 show.
- 6 MR. PERKINS: So what we've provided you is a
- 7 copy of Commonwealth Edison's customer records for
- 8 Mr. Smetters.
- 9 MR. GOLDSTEIN: And I do have something from
- 10 Integrys that shows that on July 13th, which pretty
- 11 much matches up with ComEd's records, that the
- 12 termination fee was liquidated.
- 13 MR. STUART SMETTERS: I will also give you Rush
- 14 University as well as I will get the records from
- 15 Blue Cross Blue Shield as well as the records from
- 16 Public Systems. You will find that there's no way in
- 17 the world I could have authorized it at that time
- 18 because I was in a hospital bed having surgery.
- 19 JUDGE RILEY: We'll set a date to reconvene
- 20 then.
- Do you have any time available in May?
- MR. GOLDSTEIN: No. As you know, Judge, almost

- 1 half the month is taken up with the NATO Summit
- 2 stuff.
- JUDGE RILEY: That's understood. We're well
- 4 past that.
- 5 MR. GOLDSTEIN: And so there's just no chance
- 6 to do it the rest of the month.
- JUDGE RILEY: When do we want to revisit this,
- 8 obviously in June?
- 9 MR. GOLDSTEIN: How about June 19th in the
- 10 afternoon?
- 11 JUDGE RILEY: June 19th? That should give you
- 12 plenty of times to get your records together.
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: Easily. Can I borrow one
- 14 of these?
- JUDGE RILEY: Sure. You'll get a formal notice
- 16 of this from the Chief Clerk's Office. They will
- 17 send you a confirmation of the date and the time.
- 18 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Okay.
- 19 JUDGE RILEY: June 19th, at 11:00 a.m. or did
- 20 you say the afternoon?
- MR. GOLDSTEIN: 1:00 o'clock, Judge?
- MR. STUART SMETTERS: 11:00 would be far

- 1 superior because right now --
- 2 MR. GOLDSTEIN: I have a trial at 11:00. Could
- 3 we do it June 20th at 11:00 then?
- 4 JUDGE RILEY: June 20th?
- 5 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Is that okay with you?
- 6 MR. STUART SMETTERS: Yes. I do run very close
- 7 because I had to use the bike and the train.
- 8 JUDGE RILEY: That will be for status, so,
- 9 again, we will not be at the evidentiary stage of the
- 10 proceeding. It's just going to be to discuss the
- documentation that you're going to submit to
- 12 Mr. Goldstein. And he will see if he can square what
- 13 you give him with ComEd's records and with
- 14 Mr. Perkins' records and see what resolution there
- 15 might be.
- So anyway -- and, as I said, I'll have
- 17 the Chief Clerk's Office send out a formal note to
- 18 you and to all the parties of the date and time, and
- we'll plan to reconvene on June 20th, at 11:00 a.m.
- MR. GOLDSTEIN: Thank you, Judge.
- 21 MR. PERKINS: Thank you, Judge.

22

1	(Whereupon, the above-entitled
2	matter was continued to June
3	20, 2011, at 11:00 a.m.)
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	